

## A CROSS SECTION THEOREM AND AN APPLICATION TO $C^*$ -ALGEBRAS

ROBERT R. KALLMAN<sup>1</sup> AND R. D. MAULDIN

**ABSTRACT.** The purpose of this note is to prove a cross section theorem for certain equivalence relations on Borel subsets of a Polish space. This theorem is then applied to show that cross sections always exist on countably separated Borel subsets of the dual of a separable  $C^*$ -algebra.

See Auslander-Moore [2], Bourbaki [3], Kuratowski [9], and Mackey [12] for the main results and notation in Polish set theory used in this paper.

The main result of this note is the following theorem.

**THEOREM 1.** *Let  $B$  be a Borel subset of the Polish space  $X$ . Let  $R$  be an equivalence relation on  $B$  such that each  $R$ -equivalence class is both a  $G_\delta$  and an  $F_\sigma$  in  $X$ , and such that the  $R$ -saturation of each relatively open subset of  $B$  is Borel. Then the quotient Borel space  $B/R$  is standard, and there is a Borel cross section  $f: B/R \rightarrow B$  for  $R$ .*

Notice that if the  $R$ -saturation of each relatively closed subset of  $B$  is Borel, then the  $R$ -saturation of each relatively open subset of  $B$  is Borel, for each relatively open subset of  $B$  is the countable union of relatively closed sets.

A number of preliminary lemmas are proved first.

**LEMMA 2.** *Let  $(Y, d)$  be a separable metric space and let  $R$  be an equivalence relation on  $Y$  such that the  $R$ -saturation of each open set is Borel. Then there is a Borel set  $S$  whose intersection with each  $R$ -equivalence class which is complete with respect to  $d$  is nonempty, and whose intersection with each  $R$ -equivalence class is at most one point.*

**PROOF.** By the proofs (but not the statements) of Theorem 4, p. 206, Bourbaki [3] and Lemme 2, p. 279, Dixmier [4], there exists a decreasing sequence of Borel subsets of  $Y$ , say  $S_n$ , so that  $S_n \cap R(y) \neq \emptyset$ ,  $\text{diameter}(S_n \cap R(y)) \rightarrow 0$ , and  $\bigcap_{n \geq 1} (S_n \cap R(y)) = \bigcap_{n \geq 1} ((S_n \cap R(y)) \cap R(y))$  for each  $y$  in  $Y$ . Let  $S = \bigcap_{n \geq 1} S_n$ .  $S$  is a Borel subset of  $Y$ , the intersection of  $S$  with each complete  $R$ -equivalence class is nonempty, and the intersection of  $S$  with each  $R$ -equivalence class is at most one point. Q.E.D.

**LEMMA 3.** *Let  $Y$  be a Polish space and  $D$  a subset of  $Y$  which is both a  $G_\delta$  and*

---

Received by the editors November 15, 1976 and, in revised form, July 18, 1977.

AMS (MOS) subject classifications (1970). Primary 28A05, 46L05; Secondary 04A15, 54C65.

Key words and phrases. Quotient Borel space, Borel cross section,  $C^*$ -algebra.

<sup>1</sup>Supported in part by NSF Grant MPS73-08628.

© American Mathematical Society 1978

an  $F_\sigma$ . Then there is an open set  $V$  in  $Y$  so that  $D \cap V$  is nonempty and  $D \cap V$  is closed in  $V$ .

PROOF. We may assume that  $\overline{D} = Y$ . Since  $D$  is a  $G_\delta$ ,  $Y - D$  is a countable union of closed sets. None of these closed sets has an interior, for  $D$  is dense in  $Y$ . But  $D$  is a countable union of closed sets. The Baire category theorem implies that one of these closed sets has an interior. Hence, there exists an open set  $V$  so that  $V$  is contained in  $D$ . Q.E.D.

LEMMA 4. Let  $X$  and  $R$  be as in Theorem 1. Then  $X/R$  is countably separated.

PROOF. Let  $V_m$  ( $m \geq 1$ ) be a basis for the topology of  $X$ . Then the  $R(V_m)$  ( $m \geq 1$ ) are Borel sets which separate the  $R$ -equivalence classes. To see this, let  $a$  and  $b$  be elements of  $X$  so that  $R(a)$  and  $R(b)$  are disjoint. If  $R(b)$  is not contained in  $\overline{R(a)}$ , there exists a  $c$  in  $R(b)$  and a positive integer  $m$  so that  $c$  is in  $V_m$  and  $V_m \cap \overline{R(a)} = \emptyset$ . But then  $V_m \cap R(a) = \emptyset$ , and so  $R(V_m) \cap R(a)$  is empty. Hence,  $R(b)$  is contained in  $R(V_m)$  and  $R(a)$  is contained in  $X - R(V_m)$ . So we may assume that  $R(b)$  is contained in  $\overline{R(a)}$ . It follows from Lemma 3 that there is an integer  $m$  so that  $R(a) \cap V_m$  is nonempty and  $R(a) \cap V_m = \overline{R(a)} \cap V_m$ . But then  $R(V_m) \cap R(b)$  is empty. If not, there exists a  $c$  in  $R(b) \cap V_m \subseteq \overline{R(a)} \cap V_m = R(a) \cap V_m$ . Hence,  $R(b) = R(c) = R(a)$ . Contradiction. Hence,  $R(a)$  is contained in  $R(V_m)$  and  $R(b)$  is contained in  $X - R(V_m)$ . Q.E.D.

PROOF OF THEOREM 1. If  $V$  is an open subset of  $X$  and  $U = B \cap V$ ,  $R$  defines an equivalence relation  $R_U$  on  $U$  by  $R_U(b) = R(b) \cap U$ . The  $R_U$ -saturation of any open set is Borel. Now  $V$  itself is a Polish space, and each  $R_U$ -equivalence class is both a  $G_\delta$  and an  $F_\sigma$  in  $V$ . Hence, by Lemma 2, there is a Borel set  $S$  which intersects each  $R_U$ -equivalence class in at most one point, and which intersects each  $R_U$ -equivalence class which is closed in  $V$  in exactly one point. Let  $V_m$  ( $m \geq 1$ ) be a basis for the topology of  $X$ . For each  $V_m$ , let  $S_m$  be a corresponding  $S$ , and let  $S' = \bigcup_{m \geq 1} S_m$ .  $S'$  is a Borel subset of  $X$ .  $S'$  intersects each  $R$ -equivalence class in at most countably many points. Furthermore,  $S'$  intersects each  $R$ -equivalence class in at least one point by Lemma 3.  $X/R$  is countably separated, and therefore is Borel isomorphic to an analytic subset of  $[0, 1]$  by Proposition 2.9, p. 8, of Auslander-Moore [2]. Let  $g: S' \rightarrow X/R$  be the natural surjective Borel mapping. The graph of  $g$ , say  $C$ , is a Borel subset of  $S' \times [0, 1]$ . Horizontal sections of  $C$  are at most countable. Hence, theorems of S. Braun and N. Luzin (see 42.4.5, p. 378, and 42.5.3, p. 381, of Hahn [8]) show that the horizontal projection of  $C$ , namely  $X/R$ , is standard and that there exists a Borel subset  $S''$  of  $S'$  so that  $g|S''$  is a bijection onto  $X/R$ . Let  $f = (g|S'')^{-1}$ .  $f$  is a Borel mapping by Souslin's theorem. Q.E.D.

See Dixmier [5] for most of the notation and results on  $C^*$ -algebras used in this note. The Borel structure on the dual of a  $C^*$ -algebra is that generated by the hull-kernel topology. The following corollary might be a useful tool in

proving local versions of known theorems in  $C^*$ -algebras and group representations (see, for instance, Moore's appendix to Auslander and Kostant [1]).

**COROLLARY 5.** *Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a separable  $C^*$ -algebra and let  $B$  be a Borel subset of  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$  whose relative Borel structure separates points. Then  $B$  is standard, and there is a Borel cross section  $f: B \rightarrow \text{Irr}(\mathcal{A})$ .*

**PROOF.** Let  $p: \hat{\pi} \rightarrow \text{kernel}(\hat{\pi}), \hat{\mathcal{A}} \rightarrow \text{Prim}(\mathcal{A})$ , be the natural open mapping. From the definition of the topology of  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ ,  $U$  is open in  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$  if and only if  $p(U)$  is open in  $\text{Prim}(\mathcal{A})$ , in which case  $U = p^{-1}(p(U))$ . Now consider the set  $\mathcal{S}$  of all subsets  $B$  of  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$  such that  $B = p^{-1}(p(B))$ .  $\mathcal{S}$  is clearly closed under countable unions, and  $\mathcal{S}$  is closed under complements since  $p$  is surjective. Since  $\mathcal{S}$  contains the open subsets of  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ ,  $\mathcal{S}$  therefore contains all Borel subsets of  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ . Therefore,  $B$  is a Borel subset of  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$  if and only if  $p(B)$  is a Borel subset of  $\text{Prim}(\mathcal{A})$ . Hence, if  $B$  is a Borel subset of  $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ , and if the relative Borel structure on  $B$  separates points, then  $p$  is one-to-one on  $B$ , and  $B$  and  $p(B)$  are Borel isomorphic. But  $\text{Prim}(\mathcal{A})$  is a standard Borel space by Theorem 2.4 of Effros [7]. Hence,  $p(B)$ , and therefore  $B$ , are standard Borel spaces.

Let  $q: \text{Irr}(\mathcal{A}) \rightarrow \hat{\mathcal{A}}$  be the natural continuous open mapping. As  $\text{Prim}(\mathcal{A})$  is  $T_0$  with a countable basis for its topology, each point of  $\text{Prim}(\mathcal{A})$  is the intersection of a closed set and a  $G_\delta$ . Hence,  $q^{-1}(b) = (p \circ q)^{-1}(p(b))$  is a  $G_\delta$  in  $\text{Irr}(\mathcal{A})$  for all  $b$  in  $B$ . Each  $q^{-1}(b)$  is also an  $F_\sigma$  by Lemma 2.7 and Lemma 4.1 of Effros [6]. Let  $R$  be the equivalence relation on  $q^{-1}(B)$  given by point inverses under  $q$ . Each  $R$ -equivalence class is both a  $G_\delta$  and an  $F_\sigma$  in  $\text{Irr}(\mathcal{A})$ . The  $R$ -saturation of a relatively open subset of  $q^{-1}(B)$  is again relatively open, and therefore Borel, since  $q|_{q^{-1}(B)}$  is open onto  $B$ . Hence, Theorem 1 and Souslin's theorem show that  $q^{-1}(B)/R$  and  $B$  are Borel isomorphic, and there is a cross section  $f: B \rightarrow \text{Irr}(\mathcal{A})$ . Q.E.D.

The following corollary has some applications. Consider the following setup. Let  $X$  be a standard Borel space,  $Y$  a Polish space, and  $R$  an equivalence relation on  $Y$  such that the  $R$ -saturation of open sets is Borel.  $R$  gives rise to an equivalence relation  $R'$  on  $X \times Y$  by  $R'(x, y) = \{x\} \times R(y)$ .

**COROLLARY 6.** *Let  $B$  be a Borel subset of  $X \times Y$  which is saturated with respect to  $R'$ . Suppose that each  $R'$ -equivalence class contained in  $B$  is, viewed as a subset of  $Y$ , both a  $G_\delta$  and an  $F_\sigma$ . Then  $B/R'$  is standard, and there exists a Borel cross section  $f: B/R' \rightarrow B$  for  $R'$ .*

**PROOF.** There exists a Polish space  $Z$  and a one-to-one Borel mapping  $p: Z \rightarrow X$ . Let  $g: (z, y) \rightarrow (p(z), y), Z \times Y \rightarrow X \times Y$ . Let  $R'' = g^{-1}(R')$  and  $B' = g^{-1}(B)$ . Each  $R''$ -equivalence class contained in  $B'$  is both a  $G_\delta$  and an  $F_\sigma$  since each  $R'$ -equivalence class in  $B$  is, viewed as a subset of  $Y$ , a  $G_\delta$  and an  $F_\sigma$ , and since the vertical sections of  $Z \times Y$  are closed. The  $R''$ -saturation of an open set in  $Z \times Y$  is Borel. It suffices to prove this for open rectangles. Let  $U \times V$  be open in  $Z \times Y$ , where  $U$  is open in  $Z$  and  $V$  is open in  $Y$ . But

$$R''(U \times V) = g^{-1}(R'(p(U) \times V)) = g^{-1}(p(U) \times R(V)),$$

which certainly is Borel in  $Z \times Y$ . Hence, by Theorem 1,  $B'/R''$  is standard, and there exists a Borel cross section  $f': B'/R'' \rightarrow B'$ . Choose a sequence  $B'_n$  ( $n \geq 1$ ) of  $R''$ -saturated Borel subsets of  $B'$  which separate the  $R''$ -equivalence classes. Then the  $g(B'_n)$  ( $n \geq 1$ ) are  $R'$ -saturated Borel subsets of  $B$  which separate the  $R'$ -equivalence classes. Hence,  $B/R'$  is countably separated. Furthermore,  $g(f'(B'/R''))$  is a Borel transversal for the  $R'$ -equivalence classes of  $B$ . Let  $h: g(f'(B'/R'')) \rightarrow B/R'$  be the natural one-to-one Borel mapping. Then  $B/R'$  is standard by Souslin's theorem, and  $f = h^{-1}: B/R' \rightarrow B$  is a Borel cross section for  $R'$ . Q.E.D.

The following examples help to clarify the hypotheses of Theorem 1.

EXAMPLE 7. Note that Theorem 1 may fail if each  $R$ -equivalence class is only required to be an  $F_\sigma$  set, even if the  $R$ -saturation of each open set is open and  $B/R$  is metrizable. This follows from the fact that if  $A$  is an analytic nonborelian subset of  $J$ , the irrational numbers, then there is a Borel subset  $B$  of  $J \times J$  such that the projection map restricted to  $B$  is open and projects  $B$  onto  $A$ . Also, each vertical section of  $B$  may be taken to be an  $F_\sigma$  subset of (see Taimanov [11]).

EXAMPLE 8. There is a Borel subset  $B$  of  $J \times J$  such that each vertical section of  $B$  is an  $F_\sigma$  subset of  $J$ , the projection  $\pi$  onto the first axis, restricted to  $B$ , is open,  $\pi(B) = J$ , and yet there is no Borel cross section (in this case, there is no Borel uniformization). Recall that if  $E$  is a subset of  $X \times Y$ , then a uniformization of  $E$  is a subset  $F$  of  $E$  such that  $E_x \neq \emptyset$  if and only if  $F_x$  consists of exactly one point, where  $E_x = \{y | (x, y) \text{ is in } E\}$ .

First, let  $M$  be a Borel subset of  $J \times J$  such that  $\pi(M) = J$ ,  $M$  has no Borel uniformization, and each vertical section of  $M$  is closed. The existence of such an  $M$  can be seen as follows. Let  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  be disjoint coanalytic subsets of  $J$  which are not Borel separable (see Sierpinski [10] for the existence of these  $C$ 's). Let  $A_1 = J - C_1$  and  $A_2 = J - C_2$ .  $A_1$  and  $A_2$  are analytic sets whose union is  $J$ . Let  $M_i$  be a closed subset of  $J \times J$  which projects onto  $A_i$  ( $i = 1, 2$ ). Let  $M$  be the Borel set which is the union of  $M_1$  and  $M_2$ . If  $\Gamma$  were a Borel uniformization of  $M$ , then  $D = \pi(\Gamma \cap (M_1 - M_2))$  would be a Borel subset of  $J$  which contains  $C_2$  and has empty intersection with  $C_1$ . Thus,  $M$  has no Borel uniformization. This argument for the existence of  $M$  is due to D. Blackwell.

Identify  $J$  with  $N^N$ . Let  $h_{n_1, \dots, n_k}$  be a homeomorphism of  $J$  onto  $J(n_1, \dots, n_k) = \{z | z \text{ is in } J \text{ and } z_i = n_i \text{ (} 1 \leq i \leq k)\}$ , and let  $T_{n_1, \dots, n_k}: (x, z) \rightarrow (x, h_{n_1, \dots, n_k}(z))$ ,  $J \times J \rightarrow J \times J$ . Let  $B = \bigcup T_{n_1, \dots, n_k}(M)$ . Then  $B$  is a Borel subset of  $J \times J$ ,  $\pi|B$  is open,  $\pi(B) = J$ , and each vertical section of  $B$  is an  $F_\sigma$ . If  $\Gamma$  were a Borel uniformization for  $B$ , then  $C = \bigcup_n T_n^{-1}((\Gamma \cap T_n(M)) - \bigcup_{k < n} T_k(M))$  would be a Borel uniformization of  $M$ . Here  $k$  and  $n$  denote finite multi-indices and  $<$  is the usual lexicographic order.

Suppose that  $B$  is a Borel subset of a Polish space  $X$ ,  $R$  is an equivalence relation on  $B$  such that each equivalence class is a  $G_\delta$  in  $X$ , and such that the

saturation of relatively open sets is Borel. D. Miller has pointed out to the authors that Lemmas 3 and 4 may be altered slightly to prove that  $B/R$  is countably separated. Let  $V_m$  ( $m \geq 1$ ) be as in Lemma 4. We claim that the  $R(V_m)$  ( $m \geq 1$ ) separate the  $R$ -equivalence classes. Let  $a$  and  $b$  be in  $X$  so that  $R(a)$  and  $R(b)$  are disjoint. If  $R(b)$  is not contained in  $\overline{R(a)}$ , proceed as in Lemma 4. So suppose that  $R(b)$  is contained in  $\overline{R(a)}$ . By a symmetric argument we may assume that  $R(a)$  is contained in  $\overline{R(b)}$ . Thus, we may assume that  $\overline{R(a)} = \overline{R(b)}$ . But  $R(a)$ , being a  $G_\delta$ , is comeager in  $\overline{R(a)}$ , and  $R(b)$ , being a  $G_\delta$ , is comeager in  $\overline{R(b)}$ . Hence,  $R(a) \cap R(b)$  is nonempty, a contradiction. The following questions remain. Is  $B/R$  standard? Even if  $B/R$  is standard, is there a cross section? The authors do not know the answers to these questions even if  $R$  is an open equivalence relation and  $B/R$  is metrizable. Note that if the last question has an affirmative answer, then there is a natural Borel cross section from  $\text{Prim}(\mathcal{Q}) \rightarrow \text{Irr}(\mathcal{Q})$ .

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. L. Auslander and B. Kostant, *Polarization and unitary representations of solvable Lie groups*, Invent. Math. **14** (1971), 255–354.
2. L. Auslander and C. C. Moore, *Unitary representations of solvable Lie groups*, Mem Amer. Math. Soc., no. 62 (1966).
3. N. Bourbaki, *General topology*. II, Hermann, Paris, 1966.
4. J. Dixmier, *Dual et quasi-dual d'une algèbre de Banach involutive*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **104** (1962), 278–283.
5. \_\_\_\_\_, *Les  $C^*$ -algèbres et leurs représentations*, Gauthier-Villars, Paris, 1969.
6. E. G. Effros, *Transformation groups and  $C^*$ -algebras*, Ann. of Math. **81** (1965), 38–55.
7. \_\_\_\_\_, *A decomposition theory for representations of  $C^*$ -algebras*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **107** (1963), 83–106.
8. H. Hahn, *Reelle Funktionen*, Akad.-Verlag, Leipzig, 1932.
9. C. Kuratowski, *Topology*. I, Academic Press, New York, 1966.
10. W. Sierpinski, *Sur deux complémentaires analytiques non séparables*, Fund. Math. **17** (1931), 296–297.
11. A. D. Taimanov, *On open images of Borel sets*, Mat. Sb. **37** (1955), 293–300.
12. G. W. Mackey, *Borel structure in groups and their duals*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **85** (1957), 134–165.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA, GAINESVILLE, FLORIDA 32611